WILLIAM JAMES ON PSYCHOPATHOLOGY: AN ARCHIVAL MEMOIR

EUGENE TAYLOR*
Harvard Medical School

In February of 1977, while reading in William JAMES's unpublished manuscript collection at Harvard, I made two significant discoveries. The first was a complete set of handwritten notes by JAMES for a series of lectures that he delivered before the Lowell Institute in 1896 on psychopathology entitled, "Exceptional Mental States". His titles were: "Dreams and Hypnotism," "Automatism," "Hysteria," "Multiple Personality," "Demoniacal Possession," "Witchcraft," "Degeneration," and "Genius." They were the second of three lecture series he delivered for the Lowell Institute during the course of his career. The first was in 1878 when he spoke on "The Brain and the Mind". These lectures were published in scattered places as essays and then incorporated as major chapters in his *Principles of Psychology.* His most famous Lowell lectures were entitled "Pragmatism", which he delivered in 1906. These appeared in book form in 1907. But the 1896 lectures on psychopathology were never published, partly because of JAMES's failing health at the time, and partly due to a redirection of his attention to the collection of documents on religious autobiography. Significantly, major portions of his psychopathology lectures found their way into various chapters in the *Varieties of Religious Experience* (1902). The content of these 1896 Lowell

*EUGENE TAYLOR: Associate in Psychiatry at Harvard Medical School and Consultant in the History of Psychiatry at the Massachusetts General Hospital. Address: Rare Books. Countway Library of Medicine. 10 Shattuck St. Boston MA 02115. USA.

Lectures appeared to focus almost exclusively on what was then known about subconscious phenomena, treating dynamic processes within the individual first, then showing the pathological working of subconscious processes in the social sphere. Obviously by focusing on the subliminal consciousness, these unpublished lectures represented a major conceptual link between JAMES's emphasis on the center of attention, that is, a cognitive psychology of consciousness in the *Principles* (1890) and his emphasis on the primacy of mystical consciousness in the *Varieties* (1902).

The second major discovery at the time was a letter from Henry JAMES, Jr. to the Harvard College Librarian, dated 1923, referring to the transfer of books with annotations from the JAMES family library to Harvard College upon the death of Alice Gibbens JAMES. The letter in question mentions some 936 pieces that were transferred on themes such as demon possession, abnormal psychology, multiple personality, and religious autobiography. Many of these volumes contained JAMES's marginal marks, signature, brief annotations, and a hand pencilled index that JAMES often constructed for his own research purposes. A search was then launched for the original lists of the books given. Several other additional lists of annotated books afterwards sold or given at other times to the library also turned up, but it was quickly ascertained that the 936 pieces on themes related to the Exceptional Mental States lecture notes had been labled as belonging to JAMES, but then shelved in the open stacks of Widener Library's three million volume collection, where they had remained safely housed but scattered for more than fifty years. On comparing the original handwritten lecture notes with the lists of books on topics related to each lecture, it was found that many volumes scattered in the Widener collection contained marks and annotations keyed to the unpublished 1896 lecture notes (1).

These discoveries in turn led to a search of the Lowell Institute papers, which brought forth the original lecture announcements, admission tickets, Janitor's comments about the series, and the preliminary correspondence for setting up the talks between William JAMES and Augustus LOWELL. A search was made of the Boston Public Library holdings and newspaper accounts of each one of JAMES's lectures were soon discovered, including two summaries of the entire series. The staff at the Harvard University Archives then drew my attention to the Harvard College Library Charging Records, which showed all the books that JAMES checked out of the library from 1861 to 1896. The main obstacle to consulting these lists was that major segments of books checked out were recorded in experimental library classification systems long since abandoned. In order to identify these entries the entire history of the Harvard Library classification systems had to be reconstructed first. Only then could the cryptic numbers be translated into author, title, and date of publication. Once this was accomplished, it was possible to locate additional sources mentioned in the unpublished lecture notes, to call them from the library shelves, and to discover that many of these were purchased by JAMES from Library funds. JAMES then checked the books out, sometimes for two or three years at a time, annotated them as if they were his own, and then returned them to the library shelves (2).

These discoveries led in turn to materials in the published literature by JAMES that had never appeared on any of the standard William JAMES bibliographies by PERRY, PERRY's son, John McDERMOTT, or Ignas SKRUPSKELIS (3). The materials also pointed the way to a search for lost or scattered correspondence between JAMES and a number of significant but oftentimes obscure personalities who provided him with material because they were involved in similar researches. The end result was that it became possible to reconstruct the lectures as JAMES originally gave them, and this reconstruction has been recently published by Charles Scribner's Sons in New York (4).

As the Exceptional Mental States project gained momentum various clues about the historical context of the lectures became evident. Two questions were immediately raised: "What were some of the historical precursors to JAMES's ideas on psychopathology?" and "What were the subsequent effects of JAMES's 1896 Lectures on developments in abnormal psychology after 1900?". Concerning the first question, discovery was soon made of the trunk containing Henry JAMES, Senior's annotated Swedenborg collection (6). The content of works by Swedenborg, plus other materials from the James family library eventually included in this trunk, reveals the strong influence on William JAMES of Henry JAMES, Senior, and through him, Ralph Waldo EMERSON and the transcendentalist circle in Concord, Boston, and Cambridge. Through EMERSON and the English physician, James John Garth WILKINSON, the major translator of Swedenborg's scientific and medical writings, the James family entered Thomas CARLYLE's literary circle, which included such influential figures on William JAMES as Alexander BAIN, Alfred Lord TENNYSON, and John Stewart MILL. Two lines of influence are particularly evident from an exploration of the contents of this trunk. First, William JAMES derived important inspiration for his stream of consciousness metaphor from both EMERSON and WILKINSON. This, and other ideas about consciousness similarly derived, can be traced as influences on the Exceptional Mental States lectures. Second, philosophical ideas on the Swedenborgian doctrine of Use were interpreted by both EMERSON and Henry JAMES, Senior, in such a way as to have a major impact on the early formulation of pragmatism by William JAMES and Charles Sanders PEIRCE in the early 1870s. The influence of pragmatism on the development of American Functional psychology I have alluded to in my American Psychological Association address on Swedenborg in 1982 (6).

And what of the impact of JAMES' ideas on development in the field of psychopathology after 1900?. Let me say first that reconstruction of the 1896 lectures made it clear that JAMES knew much more about the most modern advances in dynamic psychotherapy then known and that his unique contributions to the development of this field remain consistently underrated. He was the first to introduce JANET's work to American psychology, he was the first to introduce the work of BREUER and FREUD; he was a staunch defender of the efficacy of the American religious psychotherapies; he trained such distinguished students as Boris SIDIS, Elmer Ernest SOUTHARD, Horatio W. DRESSER, William HEALEY, Barnard SACHS, Richard Clarke CABOT, Edward Wyllys TAYLOR, L. Eugene EMERSON, and George Arthur WATERMAN, all of whom in some way became pioneers in the modern psychology of the subconscious

in the opening decades of the Twentieth Century; and documents exist to directly trace his influence on such diverse fields as psychical research social ethics, psychology of religion, pastoral counseling, psychiatric social work, delinquency and juvenile psychopathology, psychoanalysis, suggestive therapeutics, and mental healing.

Accordingly, a systematic search was launched for the papers of JAMES's students, colleagues, and friends, with a particular focus on anyone who was in anyway associated with the field of psychotherapeutics. Very quickly, with the help of the published work of such distinguished medical historians as Henri ELLENBERGER, Nathan G. HALE, John BURNHAM, and George GIFFORD, a much larger picture began to emerge that transcended JAMES's influence alone of what has been variously called the Boston School of Abnormal Psychology, or the Boston School of Psychotherapy (7). JAMES remained, however, at the heart of these developments, but his impact has remained largly hidden from these researchers and has only now just been brought to light with the publication of his 1896 Lowell Lectures.

With a few significant exceptions, the search for the papers of members of the so-called Boston School was confined to the New England area, primarily in and around Boston, with some excursions to New York and Philadelphia. The collection of these materials was aided considerably at this time by a small archival research grant from the American Philosophical Society. Finally, it was ascertained that enough new archival material had been collected to warrant a course of public lectures on the subject. Accordingly, on my behalf, members of the Boston Medical Library and the Massachusetts Medical Society approached the Trustees of the Lowell Institute and a series of eight Lowell Lectures was arranged, to be delivered at the Boston Public Library in February and March of 1982, all eight talks to be given by the same speaker in the older tradition of previous Lowell Lectures before the turn of the century (8).

The series was entitled "The Boston School of Psychotherapy; Science, Healing, and Consciousness in 19th Century New England", and the original eight lecture titles were:

1.- "Early Neurological Influences; Electrization Therapy, Trance, and the Functional Neuroses".
2.- "Founders of the Boston School; JAMES, PUTNAM, PRINCE, and JANET".
3.- "Psychical Research Looks at Mental Healing; Mediumship and the Occult".
4.- "The Therapeutic Function of Philosophy; ROYCE, MÜNSTERBERG, and PEIRCE".
5.- "Psychiatric Social Work and Medical Ethics; CABOT and CANNON".
6.- "The Marriage of Psychology and Religion; Pastoral Counseling and the the Emmanuel Movement".
7.- "Some distinguished Students of the Founders; WATERMAN, SIDIS, CORIAT, and EMERSON".
8.- "Institutionalization of the Eclectic Tradition; Worcester State, Boston Psychopathic, The Waverly Asylum, the MGH, Boston City Hospital, and the Harvard Psychological Clinic".

Since the lectures were given, two more lectures have been added; namely, "Contributions from the Organic Theorists; G.V.T. HAMILTON, E.E. SOUTHARD, and W.B. CANNON" and "The New Asylum Psychiatry; COWLES, MEYER and HALL". Each of the lectures draws on some special archival collections and each has a specific theme related to the whole (9).

The first lecture pointed out that the post-Civil War period saw a dramatic rise in the progress of psychotherapy, especially in the fields of neurology and mental therapeutics. Electrization therapy, hypnosis, diet and exercise, the Rest Cure, and even faith healing challenged accepted notions of mental treatment, as did the effects of war injuries, and such events as the trial of the assassin, Guiteau. Out of this milieu neurology was born and asylum psychiatry became transformed.

The main point of the lecture was that the great repository of a uniquely American psychology of the subconscious in the early 19th century was composed of, first, literature by the early prophets of the mental healing movement --men such as John Bevoe DODD, Charles POYEN, Phineas Parkhurst QUIMBY, and Andrew Jackson DAVIS. Second were the great literary figures of the 1840 and 1950's; there are pairs of them -EMERSON and THOREAU, MELVILLE and HAWTHORNE, and Oliver Wendell HOLMES, Sr., and Silas Weir MITCHELL. Then after the Civil War the historic event following the founding of the American Neurological Association was George Miller BEARD's paper, delivered in 1876, on the potency of definite expectation in the cause and cure of disease. His most vocal opponent was William Alexander HAMMOND, supported by James Jackson PUTNAM (10). But PUTNAM soon changed his mind.

The second lecture profiled the founders of the so-called Boston School of Psychotherapy. Following BEARD, men such as William JAMES and Morton PRINCE drew both PUTNAM and Boston's French connection, Pierre JANET into their circle. These men stood at the forefront of the new experimental psychology of the subconscious. Particularly PUTNAM and PRINCE became collaborators through Harvard and Tufts, and began to apply their practical knowledge to the treatment of patients through Boston's famous teaching hospitals and through the development of specialized private practice. Drawing on the latest developments in England, Germany, and especially France, their approach to the treatment of mental disease was both interdisciplinary and eclectic, and was an orientation quite suited to the tradition of New England medicine (11).

The third lecture highlighted the great successes of the mental healers, which brought on vehement attacks from the orthodox medical men and spurred the creation of the American Society for Psychical Research, whose purpose was to scientifically test the healers's claims. One of the first offical bodies in psychology to be convened in this country, the Society found evidence in favor of sound psychotherapeutic practices among the mental healers, and saw their work as transforming science (12).

The fourth lecture focused on the contribution of philosophy to psychotherapy, especially in the work of Josiah ROYCE, Hugo MÜNSTERBERG, and Charles Sanders PEIRCE. From the standpoint of metaphysics and ontology, science was a tool and philosophy its guide. This was the attitude of many Boston practitioners, who laid stress not on grand logical systems of ultimate truth, but on a sound, workable philosophy

of life in the healthy functioning of each person. Even philosophers practiced and wrote on psychotherapy in Boston at the turn of the century (13).

The fifth lecture on psychiatric social work and medical ethics was illustrated by the work of Richard Clarke CABOT and Ida M. CANNON. After launching the first Medical Social Service Department at the Massachusetts General Hospital, CABOT joined with PUTNAM to be the first to use social workers in the treatment of the neurasthenic poor as early as 1906. The theme of the lecture was that therapeutic cure demanded a response from society as a whole. The psychiatrist and medical man both needed aid from a new generation of nursing staff, from trained social workers handling the family context of the patient, and from the volunteer home visitor. Moreover, the ethics of cure demanded that the doctors be trained in the moral development of their own character (14).

The sixth lecture outlined the early history and relationship between the Emmanuel Movement in Boston under Elwood WORCESTER (1906-1909) and the development of Clinical Pastoral Education under Anton BOISEN in the 1920s. Again, Richard CABOT played a crucial role. Meanwhile Horatio DRESSER played a similar role in the marriage between psychology and religion within the mental healing movement. The theme of the lecture highlighted the fact that religion in late 19th century America meant not only moral education, but also the spiritual transformation of personality. When it combined with the newly developing cathartic cures of the subconscious, the result was group psychotherapy, pastoral counseling, and the idea that psychosis was basically a religious problem and not primarily a medical one (15).

The seventh lecture focused on a number of distinguished students of the founders of this Boston School, especially George WATERMAN, Boris SIDIS, Isador CORIAT, and Louville Eugene EMERSON. WATERMAN practiced psychotherapy in the Neurology Department at the MGH. SIDIS founded his own private sanitarium for the treatment of hysteria, neurasthenia, and multiple personality. CORIAT helped Worcester launch the Emmanuel Movement, then became the most orthodox Freudian in Boston until the 1930s, when the Boston Psychoanalytic Society was reorganized and the Boston Psychoanalytic Institute founded. Louville Eugene EMERSON was one of JAMES's last Ph.D's, and under PUTNAM he became the first clinical psychologist at the MGH and the Boston Psychopathic Hospital, where he practiced a modified form of Freudian and Jungian analysis. The theme of the lecture was that as teachers on the faculty of major Boston universities, founders of the Boston School spawned a new generation of students who each in some way became pioneers in the modern psychotherapeutic movements that mark the Twentieth Century (16).

The eighth lecture was a new addition to the series and focused on contribution from the organic theorists, Gilbert van Tassel HAMILTON, who pioneered in the application of experimental psychology to psychiatry; Elmer Ernest SOUTHARD, student of JAMES and distinguished figure in the field of neuropathology who became first director of the Boston Psychopathic Hospital in 1912, and Walter Bradford CANNON, physiologist and student of JAMES and BOWDITCH, who maintained an abiding interest in psychophysiology throughout his career and whose work on the autonomic nervous system

influenced psychotherapists like SIDIS, PRINCE, and CORIAT. The theme of this lecture was that while the psychogenic model prevailed in most Boston psychotherapeutic circles, by 1900 a new generation of students also appeared who were committed to a neurophysiological explanation of mental life. Variously trained in experimental psychology and medicine, these researchers nevertheless had a significant impact on the philosophy of psychotherapy in the Boston scene. While they represented vestiges of the somatic tradition before CHARCOT, their work also hinted at future, more sophisticated developments in the neurosciences after World War I (17).

The ninth lecture, also a new addition, focused on new developments in asylum psychiatry, particularly the arrangements between Edward COWLES at the McLean Asylum and G. Stanley HALL at Clark University that brought Adolf MEYER to the Worcester State Hospital, where he remained from 1896 to 1902. HALL had always aspired to have an M.D. and be a part of psychiatry. COWLES took courses under HALL at Johns Hopkins, and HALL was a key figure in the collaboration between the Worcester State Hospital and the McLean. The theme of the lecture was that the keynote of Asylum psychiatry before the Civil War had been Moral Management and it had been an age in which the chief concerns of the superintendents had been asylum architecture and the legal diagnosis of insanity followed by confinement, which was primarily but not always costodial. By the turn of the century, Asylum psychiatry had become transformed by the growth of sophisticated diagnostic nomenclature and the introduction of experimental laboratories next to the wards. Psychotherapy was practiced, but it still had not yet found a legitimate place in the treatment regime, however (18).

The primary theme of the last lecture was that the optimistic, pragmatic, and eclectic tradition that has marked the development of the Boston School of Psychotherapy has become institutionalized today and exists in a variety of different forms, which is to say that despite the onslought of FREUD and his followers and the advent of Watsonian and Skinnerian behaviorism, the eclectic Boston tradition has found permanent roots in American psychology and psychiatry (19). Meanwhile, psychoanalysts-turned-historians have tended to deemphasize the contributions of this uniquely American tradition that brought them into world wide prominence in the first place. Similarly, historians of academic scientific psychology have ommited a chronicle of the clinical tradition altogether, on the grounds that it is not scientific enough. But this is mere rhetoric of a psychology for the sake of pure science, while the clinical tradition has always represented a psychology for the sake of persons, whose practitioners also believed themselves to be scientific and experimental. In order to redress this historical shortcoming, a new picture is emerging of the Boston School's enduring influence, particularly in terms of its relevance to the continuing evolution of our contemporary mental health (20).

REFERENCES

(1) See Eugene TAYLOR, "William James on Psychopathology", *Harvard Library Bulletin,* 30; 4, October, 1982, 455-479.

(2) Clark Eliot of the Harvard University Archives first drew my attention to the Library Charging Records; Dr. Thomas Cadwallader, Indiana State University at Terre Haute, and William Whalen of the Harvard Archives staff began this reconstruction of the Library's classification systems and the task was finished by Jennifer Zukowski, now at Yale University, New Haven, Connecticut, and myself.

(3) Actually, "A List of the Published Writings of William James" was first prepared by Henry James, Jr. and Edwin B. Holt, and published in the *Journal of Philosophy, Psychology, and Scientific Method,* 1911, 18, 157-165. Ralph Barton Perry then published a more complete version, *The Writings of William James,* in 1920. Ralph Barton Perry, III, Perry's son made additions in 1950 in a manuscript now housed in Houghton Library, Harvard University, and John J. McDermott has published an update to 1977 in the back of his, *The Writings of William James; A Comprehensive edition.* Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1977. Ignas Skrupskelis, Associate editor of the William James Collected Works Project, has also recently published *William James; A reference guide.* Boston: G.K. Hall, 1977, with annotations on articles and books about James from 1868 to 1974.

(4) Eugene Taylor, *William James on Exceptional Mental States; The 1896 Lowell Lectures.* New York: Charles Scribner's Sons, 1983.

(5) Work in this collection was supported by grants from the Wesley N. Gray Fund and sponsored by the Faculty of the Swedenborg School of Religion, Newton, Massachusetts. See also Raymond H. Deck, "The 'Vastation' of Henry James, Senior; New Light on James's Theological Career". *Bulletin of Research in the Humanities,* 83, 1980, 216-247, for an analysis of the contents of the trunk.

(6) Eugene Taylor, "The Religious Psychology of Emanuel Swedenborg". Invited Address for Division 36, Psychologists Interested in Religious Issues, 90th Annual Meeting of the American Psychological Association, Washington, D.C., Published in *Studia Swedenborgiana,* 4; 4, January, 1983, 5-38.

(7) Henri Ellenberger, *The Discovery of the Unconscious.* New York: Basic Books, 1970; Nathan G. Hale, *Freud and the Americans.* New York: Oxford University Press, 1971; John Burnham, John Chynoweth Burnham, "Psychoanalysis and American Medicine, 1894-1918; Medicine, Science, and Culture". *Psychological Issues,* 5; 4, Monograph 20, New York: International Universities Press, 1967; and George E. Gifford, Jr., *Psychoanalysis, Psychotherapy, and the New England Medical Scene, 1894-1944.* New York: Science-History Pub., 1978.

(8) Ten Lowell lectures today would most often be a cosponsored series with ten different people, each delivering one lecture.

(9) "Contributions from the Organic Theorists; Hamilton, Southard, and Cannon" was presented at the annual meeting of the American Association for the History of Medicine, May 5, 1983, in Minneapolis, Minnesota, while "The New Asylum Psychiatry; Cowles, Meyer and Hall", was presented at the New York Hospital/Cornell Medical School, Division of Psychiatric History, October 19, 1983 in New York City.

(10) Part of this work was completed while I was a Visiting Fellow at the Bakken Library of Electricity in Life, Minneapolis, Minnesota, May, 1983. I have also drawn from holdings in the library of the Swedenborg School of Religion, Newton, Massachusetts, and from sources provided by Dr. Henry A. Murray as part of his Melville biography project.

(11) For this lecture I have drawn on archival collections on deposit at Houghton Library, Harvard University; The Harvard Medical Archives, Countway Library of Medicine; the Boston Public Library; and various departmental libraries at the Massachusetts General Hospital.

(12) This work was supported by a grant from the Richard Hodgson Fund for Psychical Research at Harvard University, and drew on the collections at Harvard as well as the historical files at the headquarters of the American Society for Psychical Research in New York City

(13) Part of this lecture is based on research funded by the American Philosophical Society and draws on collections at Harvard University and the Boston Public Library.

(14) Material for this lecture was gathered from the Cabot Papers, Harvard University Archives; the Ida Cannon Papers, Department of Social Service, Massachusetts General Hospital; Harvard Medical Archives, Countway Library of Medicine; and historical files at the Boston Chapter of the American Red Cross.

(15) Archival collections drawn on here came from the Episcopal Diocese of Boston; the Library of the Swedenborg School of Religion, Newton, Massachusetts, and historical work on the Emmanuel Movement done by Dr Sanford Gifford. See, for instance, his "Medical Psychotherapy and the Emmanuel Movement in Boston", in G.E. Gifford, Jr (ed.) *Psychoanalysis, Psychotherapy, and the New England Medical Scene, 1894-1944.* Note 7 above.

(16) See, for instance, Eugene Taylor, "Louville Eugene Emerson; Psychotherapy, Harvard, and the Early Boston Scene". *Harvard Medical Alumni Bulletin,* 56; 2, Spring, 1982. 42-48

(17) Materials provided here on Hamilton came from Dr. Horace Magoun, University of California at Los Angeles, Dr. Doris Nagel, New York Hospital/Cornell Medical School, and the Harvard University Archives. Southard materials came from the Harvard Medical Archives, and work on Cannon was derived from the Cannon biography project, courtesy of Dr Saul Benison, as well as materials in the Cannon Papers and Faculty Files, Harvard Medical Archives.

(18) Material here came from the Adolf Meyer Papers at Johns Hopkins University, Baltimore, Maryland, the Clark University Archives, Worcester, Massachusetts; and archives at McLean Hospital, Belmont, Massachusetts.

(19) Archival material here has come from the Clark University Archives; Archival Collections at the Massachusetts General Hospital, especially the Department of Psychiatry, and the MGH News Office; Harvard Medical Archives; Tufts University Archives; and the Library of Psychology and Social Relations, Harvard University.

(20) A summary of the series, entitled "Psychotherapy in Boston at the Turn of the Century", was presented as an invited address for Divisions 26 (History) 29 (Psychotherapy), and 12 (Clinical) at the 91st Annual meeting of the American Psychological Association, Anaheim, California, August 30, 1983. Dr. Saul Rosenzweig, Washington University, St. Louis, chaired the session.

Acknowledgments are gratefully extended to Dr. John Adams Abbott, Boston psychiatrist; Dr. Benjamin V. White, biographer of the distinguished neuropsychiatrist, Stanley Cobb; Mr. Richard Wolfe, Joseph Garland Memorial Librarian of the Boston Medical Library and Curator of Rare Books and Manuscripts, Harvard Medical School; and Dr. Henry A. Murray, Professor of Clinical Psychology, *Emeritus,* Harvard University, for their continuing support of this project.